Learner Attitudes of L2-Engaged Extensive Watching Versus Extensive Reading

ABSTRACT

The digital revolution is presenting both instructors and learners with a growing number of study choices aimed at improving L2 skills and abilities. Many of these technological advancements represent a novel means to incorporate modern media in educational approaches. This paper maintains that video watching in particular, lends itself to heightened student engagement.

There is significant evidence to support this claim and this paper contends that there is a need to develop and establish a teaching methodology, similar to Extensive Reading (ER) that incorporates the diverse functionality of digital video media. Specifically, we propose a relatively novel practice espoused from ER techniques, called Extensive Watching (EW), where students engage in film watching, with both L2 audio and captions enabled. Our contention is that, by engaging in EW activities with English Captions (EC) enabled, students can actively and simultaneously exercise both their listening and reading faculty, while developing an enjoyable and technologically relevant use of modern media. We hope to examine learner perceptions of EW, utilising established ER practices as a comparative yardstick to discern any significant effect on learner engagement, motivation, and autonomy.

Additionally, we hope that this research will add more insight to the relatively new field of EW practices and contribute an increased understanding of what benefits this methodology may possess.

KEYWORDS: Extensive Watching, Closed Captioning, Learner Motivation, Learner Autonomy, Extensive Reading
1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 A Brief Background

Over the last quarter century or more, the world has seen an immeasurable increase in digital media and Information Technology (IT). This phenomenon has affected virtually all areas of life-educational practices and ways of learning have by no means been excluded from these ubiquitous alterations.

One such digital advancement is the widespread proliferation of Digital Video Discs (DVDs) and other digitised video material with controllable subtitling capabilities. Although the use of captioned video in the EFL classroom is nothing new (Kikuchi, 1996; Uematsu, 2004), the versatility of control (especially in regards to caption choice and diversity of media) is somewhat novel. This heightened user autonomy can have (and in many ways already is having), profound effects on the realm of foreign language study and pedagogical practices. Digital video material represents a modern media advancement that provides learners with several education-specific advantages, as well as innovative and controllable viewing options – which used strategically, can be immensely constructive. As such, the practice of Extensive Watching (EW) – watching a high volume of material, with L2 captions engaged- can greatly improve the skills of learners, who engage in the activity. Although EW is a relatively new and somewhat undefined concept in English language teaching (ELT), it derives many of its tenets from the well-established practices of Extensive Reading (ER).

The ER philosophy contends that reading large volumes of L2 material (particularly material that the learner chooses to read) works to foster higher levels of motivation and learner-autonomy, thus greatly improving skills and abilities in the target language. This is a widely recognized and proven study-method and our contention is not to discern a superiority of EW over ER. Rather, we would like to show how EW is deeply rooted in the practices of ER, and therefore demonstrates many of the same constructive attributes. Specifically however, we will look to investigate, which of these two methods demonstrates a distinct (if any) preference and/or influence over learner-autonomy and motivation.

As we have previously displayed, EW is deeply couched in the practices and standards of ER (Ishimaki & Saunders, 2015), but differs in its adaptation and use of film and video viewing as its key medium for target language exposure. The practicality and effectiveness of the ER methodology has been well documented (Bell, 2001; Day & Bamford, 1998), and this paper aims to distinguish a competent and practical means of implementing EW techniques, in keeping with those principles. Additionally, since viewing DVDs and other visual media with L2 captions engaged, represents a more profound language experience – learners are not only reading, but also listening and gaining exposure to nuanced and contextualised language – we contest that this creates a more well-rounded immersion in the target language.
2. LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Video & DVD use in ELT
2.1.1 The Use of Videos (History)
There have been a number of papers published on the efficacy of using films, TV shows, and other (digital) video material as tools in the pursuit of language (Garza, 1991; Hirano & Matsumoto, 2011; Ishimaki & Saunders, 2015; Ismaili, 2013; Iwasaki, 2011; Kikuchi, 1996; Obari, 1996; Kobayashi, 1999; Lin, 2002; Nakamura, 2007; Osuka, 2007; Ryu, 2011; Takai, 1993; Taura & Taura, 2001). mechanisms, the findings and conclusions available can be quite wide-ranging and nuanced with regard to the depth of their effectiveness. Generally speaking, the main areas of contention lie in the arenas of comparative value of one method over another, or it’s overall worth and utility in terms of efficiency. Without making normative statements in favour of a particular procedure over another, a brief review of these findings is useful here.

Nakamura (2007) has conveniently listed the various advantages of video use in ELT as providing: (a) exposure to genuine and realistic language (demonstrating natural speed and pronunciation); (b) understandings of different cultural features or practices; (c) clear contexts for students and learners to understand situation-specific English usage; (d) enjoyable settings to lower students’ affective filters; (e) identification of common spoken language through subtitles and/or scripts; (f) encouragement of independent and autonomous study outside the classroom; and (g) longer concentration periods with lower levels of study fatigue. There is little research to dispute these claims, however the depth of corollary outcomes in actual language improvement is somewhat contested. That said, most academics concur that student motivation and engagement are positively influenced, when video watching activities are undertaken.

On a brief note about the relevance of this research and EW’s utility (as well as video tools in the larger context) in the realm of English as a Lingua Franca (ELF) application, Nakamura’s points (a), (b), and (c) above, speak to the understanding that ELF tends to view language and culture more dynamically than English as a foreign language (EFL) practices do. Simply put, exposure to diverse and nuanced differences of English from different regions of the world, via EW and video watching, can assist students in gaining a more profound conceptualisation of how varied English language can be in real terms. Although not all films and videos will necessarily satisfy this criteria, educators in the area of ELF could elect to focus exclusively on titles and works that do demonstrate the different ways in which language is negotiated and articulated in different cultural or social settings. However, this project did not endeavour to do this explicitly, yet the opportunity for other ELF researchers and practitioners to do so, is certainly available to them.
2.1.2 The Use of Captions (L1 and L2)

With a specific focus on subtitles on the other hand, there is some degree of dispute. Many scholars have made assertions on both sides of the debate, and a large reason for this discrepancy can be attributed to differences in the study groups, methodologies and (in many cases) the rather myopic focus of measurable marginal benefits (such as improvements in a single skill-area, for instance, listening – Hirano & Matsumoto, 2011). By example, some reports look at using video as supplemental to scripts, captions and other reading material or vice versa (Ismaili, 2013; Iwasaki, 2011); or the comparison of focusing on one video extensively, over many short clips from several sources (Osuka, 2007). Although interesting, most of these studies did not aim to investigate the benefits of watching L2 language videos with L2 captions engaged, especially not in the spirit of an extensive exercise, where high volumes of consumption are deliberately encouraged.

For our purposes, it is more useful to highlight a few studies that have attempted to discern how and why, which combination of L1 and/or L2 audio and caption use, worked best in their implementation. Taura and Taura (2001) found that the benefits of using different combinations of L1 and L2 audio and captions varied, depending upon the base-level proficiencies of the learners involved. Obari (1996) did in-class activities, and showed that with L2 audio, using both English and Japanese subtitles resulted in the best comprehension on the part of students; using only one subtitle (either L1 or L2), resulted in a similar degree of comprehension; and without subtitles resulted in the least comprehension. In addition, Ryu (2011) and Lin (2002) argued that closed caption use (either L1 or L2) lowers the difficulty level of the original material and increases overall comprehension. Also, Garza (1991) explained that watching caption-engaged video, gives students a graphic representation of a spoken language. They are therefore more empowered to begin assigning meaning to previously difficult language and can begin building up their listening comprehension, while improving reading fluency. Although not specifically related to caption use, Takai (1993) demonstrated that video materials worked better than audio materials alone (in this case, audio cassettes) to improve the listening skills of university students. Perhaps most importantly, Uematsu (2004) demonstrated that when students watched video content with English Captions (ECs) engaged, they were able to improve in multiple skill areas (both listening and reading), and thus demonstrated the advantages of this approach.

With these benefits in mind, DVDs and digital video represents a means for students to have increased access to controllable media, where the user can decide language and caption choice. Additionally, since these media can be stopped, paused, and rewound by the user, there is an undisputed gain in learner-autonomy for how they choose to control their individual study experiences.
The DVD format is not the only means of this increased control (some video-streaming websites, such as www.TED.com, have toggles for multi-lingual closed captioning capabilities; although still somewhat inaccurate, YouTube has recently added this functionality to many videos; and pay services, such as Hulu and Netflix have a similar widget for most of their available titles), yet for the logistical purposes of this study (there is a greater familiarity with DVD use over the formats mentioned above; DVDs have a deeper and longer standing market penetration; and they represent less of a technological and/or conceptual barrier to overcome), we have elected to focus on this particular digital medium. That said, students were also allowed to use other digital media (such as Hulu and Netflix), so long as they could engage English captions. Also since a key tenet of an “extensive” study philosophy is that students choose the study material, we felt that focusing on films and TV shows would provide pupils with more preference-appropriate selections. This element of choice and learner-agency is an important factor when considering extensive study exercises and their merits for student incentive and action. This consideration was a key-motivating factor, when devising this study and the authors aimed at creating a high level of choice for the students to decide from.

2.2 Principles of Extensive Reading
Although Extensive Watching is a somewhat novel concept, its development or conception is heavily couched in the philosophy, practice, and literature of ER (Holden, 2000; Lin, 2002). Of particular significance, is the “Self-Determination Theory” (Deci & Ryan, 1985), which argues that learners are fundamentally more motivated, when they have more self-control over study methods and materials. Explicitly, the theory maintains that the more autonomous control a person has; the more s/he is motivated to perform certain actions that lead to deeper and more committed study. Day and Bamford’s (2002) Top Ten-Principles of Teaching Extensive Reading, distinguish several tenets (among others) as being central to the effectiveness of ER activities: (a) students and learners should choose what they want to read; and (b) the purpose of reading is usually related to pleasure, information acquisition and general understanding. Both of these claims are consistent with the theory of self-determination and, when applied to the utilisation of films and/or TV shows, should provide a virtuous cycle of reinforcement in the fields of learner-autonomy and motivation.

However, before focusing directly on engagement and motivation levels, it will also be useful to highlight the fact that Day and Bamford also recognise two other aspects of effective ER study, which relate to our purposes here: (a) the material should be easy; and (b) a focus is placed on students reading as much as possible. With regard to the former, the levelling of written texts is considerably easier than choosing levels for films and videos. To date, there are several resources available to students and teachers, wishing to implement an effective ER programme, such
as Graded Readers. Grading films according to English difficulty or content on the other hand, is a fairly underdeveloped area of scholarship, and this proved to be a minor stumbling block when designing this survey.

On volume of material consumed, this paper maintains that exposure to English (in any form) is tantamount to any effective learning in L2 study. In keeping with that philosophy, EW activities adapted from ER principles (particularly with ECs engaged), espouse a compounded level of consumption of the target language – combining exposure to both its written and spoken forms. In a highly homogeneous and relatively insular society such as Japan (where access to natural, authentic, and contextualised English is at a rare premium), the value of this language exposure cannot be overstated.

2.3 Enhanced Learner Autonomy & Motivation
To expand on understandings of learner autonomy and motivation, Yoshino (2008) has shown that using Graded Readers in ER, had a constructive effect in this area and students demonstrated a positive attitude toward English study. She effectively determined that students were more intrinsically motivated to study on their own time and their own terms, when given a high level of choice in study materials.

Additionally, it has been argued that video use also increases learner (Hirano & Matsumoto, 2011; Ishimaki & Saunders, 2015; Ismaili, 2013; Lin, 2002; Nakamura, 2007). when these two practices are combined through EW, pupils should accordingly demonstrate a heightened level of commitment and autonomy in their educational endeavours.

3. METHODOLOGY
3.1 Research Hypotheses & Overall Project Implementation
The primary focus of this paper is to outline the effect of EW on learner motivation and autonomy, in comparison to ER, with a secondary priority of proposing, developing, and establishing an effective way to incorporate EW into a tangible teaching practice. With the former goal in mind, we attempted to design a scheme that could effectively measure student sentiment towards the two activities, over a 12-week period, in the 2015/16 Fall-Winter Semester at a private Japanese university in Tokyo. During this time several surveys were conducted throughout the exercise, which consisted of a (a) Pre-Assignment Survey, at the outset of the activity; (b) a Post-Hoc Survey, implemented at the end of term; and (c) several Extensive Watching Film/Video Reports, which students were instructed to answer after each video they watched. All of these questionnaires were facilitated via the online survey and data-generating website, Survey Monkey (www.surveymonkey.com). Although the Pre-Assignment Survey and the Post-Hoc Survey were fairly similar in content and were designed with the expressed goal of gauging student
sentiments before and after the activity, the video watching reports were slightly different. Not only were they filled-out at more regular intervals throughout the project, they also served the three-fold purposes of: (1) demonstrating evidence of task completion and film viewing during the activity; (2) providing an element of interactivity to help students digest the films they were watching, by delivering task-based activities and questions pertaining to each title watched; and (3) generating data for analysis of the project’s efficacy and development of autonomous study practices. On a final note about the surveys themselves, it is important to mention that the Pre-Assignment Survey and Extensive Watching Film/Video Reports were used more as tools to assist in verifying answers and to facilitate the data-analysis process.

Finally, at the same time as trying to discover a distinguishable preference of study, the researchers also attempted to investigate how much learner autonomy and marginal benefit (perceived or otherwise) the subjects felt they gained, by engaging in the EW exercise. That said, in order to expedite the Post-Hoc Survey in a relatively short amount of time, the majority of questions were limited to sentiments of skill-based benefit and in what ways they felt the activity helped them ameliorate their English.

3.2 Profile of the Subjects
This activity was assigned as homework to a total of 67 students in four separate 200-level English as a Lingua Franca (ELF) classes. The classes ranged in size from 15-20 students, where all the subjects were 1st year students (usually aged 18-20 years old), and Japanese nationals. The subjects were registered in Liberal Arts, Humanities, College of Arts, or Agriculture. It should be noted that mandatory enrolment in these classes and the overall number of semesters spent in the ELF programme, differs by college and is major-specific throughout their university careers. That said, since all the subjects were 1st year students, their baseline English abilities (vis-à-vis experience in university level English courses) was understood to be relatively similar.

3.3 Implementation of Extensive Watching (EW)
The completion of the EW project was mandatory and students were told that it would count toward their final grades, however in keeping with the voluntary spirit of an “extensive” study method, subjects were given a large list of films and TV shows to choose from (which included 150 titles) and asked to watch a minimum amount of material over the given time period (6 films or 12 TV shows and/or a combination thereof). Anything beyond that minimum was done on their own accord, yet they were regularly encouraged to undertake more viewing, if they wanted to.

When devising the list, the researchers brainstormed several titles that were thought to be interesting or relevant to the students themselves. During this process,
considerations were made to include a wide variety of titles and genres that would give the subjects as much choice as possible. As the authors also actively instruct these classes, a well-founded relationship with the learners’ abilities also existed, thus the list was developed with this in mind. Additionally, since the focus group members are enrolled in an English as a Lingua Franca (ELF) programme, there was a concerted effort made to include several titles, which featured a variety of world “Englishes” and accents that can be found outside of the so-called “inner circle” countries (Kachru, 1985) However, there was no effort made to influence the students’ selections toward these titles and they were given complete autonomy, when selecting what to watch.

3.4 Implementation of Extensive Reading (ER)
There is already an extant ER programme in place at the university and all students in the ELF programme are required to engage in some degree of this activity for their grade. That said, there is a fair amount of autonomy and variance with regards to how each class and instructor chooses to implement and undertake the logistics of the ER enterprise. In the instance of the classes under review here, the researchers decided to gauge student-progress and involvement via the well-established and widely available M-Reader online platform (see www.mreader.org).

For each class, word count targets (either 30,000 or 50,000 words for the semester, depending on the class) were set by the instructors and students were given a wide-range of choice regarding titles they could read and/or select. Upon completion of each work, students were asked to fill-out online quizzes that, commensurate with the M-Reader software, test reader comprehension and the veracity of task-completion. To further incentivise student engagement in this activity beyond the minimum word counts, students were told that those who read more than the minimum targets would receive higher marks in their final grades.

4. FINDINGS & RESULTS

4.1 Comparisons of EW & ER
4.1.1 Preference of Study Method
By examining the results of the Post-Hoc Survey, we can quickly surmise that the subjects had an overwhelmingly positive feeling toward the EW method in general. There are several questions that indicate the subjects had a broadly positive attitude toward the EW activity and this is in keeping with information gleaned from a previous study about the highly motivational benefits of EW (Ishimaki & Saunders, 2015).

When running comparisons of preference between EW and ER, it is obvious that the students generally favoured the EW project to the ER activity. Specifically, Q16 and Q22 (Tables 1 & 2) demonstrate a strong correlation indicating this preference with over 67% and 73% of respondents respectively, stating they either
“preferred” or “strongly preferred” the EW method to ER and found it “(much) more enjoyable and/or interesting”. Furthermore, of the respondents who were able to discern a greater amount of time spent on one activity or the other, Q23 (Table 3) shows that 34.33% of them spent more time on EW, compared with 23.88% working longer on ER. Presumably, this may indicate a preference for the previous activity, as the students would be more motivated to undertake this activity and elect to spend more time on it. Regrettfully, the researchers failed to anticipate this outcome and didn’t include a follow-up question to ascertain the reason for the greater time spent on EW. An alternate reason could certainly be due to difficulty of one method over the other and therefore the subjects had to spend more energy on it. Arguably, if a study method is thought to be too difficult, this will invariably have a negative effect on their sentiments toward it and work against promoting learner motivation. Yet, the data in Table 4, which shows respondents’ perceptions of improvement by skill area, should suffice to counter this possibility and evidence an overall learner-preference for EW-based study.

Table 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Q16 Please indicate which study method you prefer</th>
<th>Answered: 67  Skipped: 0</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Answer Choices</strong></td>
<td><strong>Responses</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Strongly prefer Extensive Watching</td>
<td>11.9% 8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Prefer Extensive Watching</td>
<td>55.2% 37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 No preference</td>
<td>23.9% 16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Prefer Extensive Reading</td>
<td>5.0% 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Strongly prefer Extensive Reading</td>
<td>0.0% 0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Q22 Please indicate which study method you find more enjoyable and/or interesting</th>
<th>Answered: 67  Skipped: 0</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Answer Choices</strong></td>
<td><strong>Responses</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Extensive Watching is much more enjoyable/interesting</td>
<td>23.0% 16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Extensive Watching is more enjoyable/interesting</td>
<td>49.3% 33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 No difference</td>
<td>22.4% 15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Extensive Reading is more enjoyable/interesting</td>
<td>2.0% 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Extensive Reading is much more enjoyable/interesting</td>
<td>1.5% 1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.1.2 Comparison of Perceived Effectiveness

Turning our attention toward a comparison of perceived effectiveness between the two activities, nearly 63% of the subjects expressed a sense that EW was more effective than ER as an overall means for improving their English skills (Q17, Table 5). Yet here again, when one takes a more myopic view to focus specifically on the four skill areas of **listening**, **reading**, **speaking**, and **writing** the replies to Q18 through Q21 (Table 6), demonstrate a more nuanced perception in each activity’s educational merit.
When considering the more aurally based areas of listening and speaking (Q18 and Q20, Table 6), we can see a strong sentiment that EW is more effective than the ER approach. This is especially true for listening (Q18, Table 6), and just under 78% of the students felt that EW was either “more effective” or “much more effective” than ER. None of the subjects felt that ER was “much more effective” than EW - it should be noted that only 1 of the 67 admissible answers indicated that ER could serve as a “more effective” means to improve listening skills. The assumed improvement of speaking skills (Q20, Table 6) also has an overall leaning toward EW as the more effective method (almost 55%), but it’s important to note that there is a significant number of responses that make no distinction between the two activities. This large number of neutral answers can also be seen in question 21 (Table 6), which measures impressions of effectiveness in the area of writing. This is likely due to the fact that neither EW nor ER are distinctively designed to focus on these two skill areas.

Despite this fact, there were still 28% that felt EW was preferable to ER for ameliorating writing skills (Q21, Table 6), compared to almost 33% who thought the opposite. That said, the difference is rather nominal in this field and the overall attitudes still correspond with the feeling that EW is more effective in general. This is also true of the comparative sentiments in the arena of reading skills. Question 19 (Table 6) shows that there is a greater number of students (34%), who believe that ER is more effective for this competence, as opposed to slightly less than 33% that think the other way. This tremendously narrow margin is very interesting and it would have been illuminating to ask follow-up questions, in order to discover what specific advantages they distinguished individually. However, this is not within the purview of this essay’s research, yet could provide an area for further study in the future.

What is significant however, is the fact that, even when asked about each individual skill area, the students did not deviate from their opinions about the overall efficacy of EW over ER. These sentiments, coupled with the information about preference above, should suffice to argue that as a study method, EW has a strong and positive effect on learner-motivation.

4.2 Summary of Results

Compared with ER, EW was proven to be more enjoyable to the subjects overall.
Further, the majority of the students felt that this method did help them improve their second language skills. There is, of course, an immeasurable benefit to engagement and motivation, when pupils believe they are advancing and/or enjoying themselves while studying. More research is necessary to look into how this increased preference for EW over ER can affect real and/or tangible improvement in English skills.

5. LIMITATIONS & CONSTRAINTS

As evidenced in some of the student responses to encountered difficulties, there were many time constraints, which proved burdensome. Question 15 in the Post-Hoc Survey attempted to find areas that students had difficulty with and not surprisingly, there were many students, who claimed that they experienced comprehension issues. This was to be expected, since there were a large number of students, who claimed they had difficulty with English comprehension in films, on the Pre-Assignment Survey; and very few said they had ever attempted to do something like this before. Of perhaps more utility however, is the fact that many of the difficulties had to do with time constraints and some of them were upset with the cost of the activity (having to hire and/or purchase DVDs on their own). Of course, these are structural issues that are more acute for time and cash strapped university students, and they may have had more positive feedback, had they been able to borrow the films and TV shows for free from the library (as they were able to do with the Graded Readers for the ER assignment).

As mentioned in the Methodology section, there is a great difficulty in distinguishing the levels of films and videos available for an EW project of this nature. ER programmes and activities benefit from having a large base of material that is levelled and graded according to skills and abilities of the readers. If there were a better means of finding and categorising films, the experiment could have benefited immensely, as the students would be able to choose titles and videos that match their general language levels. We will speak more on this in the Future Considerations section below.

6. FUTURE CONSIDERATIONS

Extensive Watching is an area of relatively limited scholarship and further research is certainly needed. Considering the effect on learner autonomy discovered herein, the authors feel confident that the EW scheme is certainly worth pursuing and perhaps further development, via a platform such as M-reader, could be beneficial. Without as many of the limitations and constraints listed above, a future study might be able to effectively discover the skill-specific and quantifiable benefits of EW practice.

Categorically, any future scholarship in the EW realm would greatly benefit
from having a database of leveled and graded film material, from which students could select titles. This speaks directly to research put forth by Krashen (1982), which argues that in order to maximise any form of language study, “comprehensible input” is immensely important. In his research, he argues that students can only learn things that they understand. This seems like an odd statement but Krashen utilises the “i + one” formula to better explain this concept, where (i) represents the level that the learner is currently at, and the (+ one) indicates a small step up from that baseline. Therefore, choosing level-appropriate material and devising an effective means of testing (which simultaneously challenges and rewards the subject) is extremely important.

Lastly, Takase (2007) argues that the time consuming business of checking ER task-completion results in reducing the reading time of learners. Since extensive study methods put a premium on language exposure, this works against its core tenets. So facilitating the checking and responses of the learners engaged in the programme is highly important. In order to maximise the effect of any extensive study programme a standardised classification of difficulty levels is immeasurably valuable. This augmented efficiency would also enhance the facilitation and administration of any future scholarship in the field.

REFERENCES


Holden, Making the most of movies: Keeping film response journals. Classroom ideas.


